BRINGING EQUITABLE BIKE SHARE TO BED-STUY

Progress Report from Bedford Stuyvesant Restoration Corporation in Partnership with NACTO

MARCH 2017



JACTO



TABLE OF CONTENTS

7 PART I

- 4 Letter from Restoration President
- 8 Executive Summary
- 13 Bedford Stuyvesant in Context

15 PART II: Building the Brooklyn Bike Share Partnership

- 16 Changing The Conversation
- 16 Assessing The Community
- 18 Getting Started
- 18 Fostering Community Ownership
- 19 Champions Step Up
- 20 "People Who Look Like Me"
- 21 Expanding The Partnership
- 22 Leveraging Partners For New Programs

25 PART III: Results and Lessons Learned

- 26 Success On the Ground
- 28 A Deeper Engagement
- 29 Champions Matter
- 29 Organizing, Not Marketing
- 30 Build From A Strong Foundation
- 30 Trust Takes Time
- 31 Money Matters

33 PART IV: Goals for 2017 and Beyond

- 34 Support Citi Bike's Expansion Beyond 12,000 Bikes
- 34 Replicate The Partnership Successes In Other NYC Neighborhoods
- 35 Expand The Understanding Of Equity And Define Metrics
- 36 Continue The Push For Equity-Focused Bike Share Policy
- 36 Strengthen The Partnership

37 APPENDIX

- 38 Restoration Partnership structure
- 39 In The News
- 40 #FreshMovesBKNY Campaign
- 41 Acknowledgements

Cover: Assemblyman Walter Mosley heading out on his Community Ride



FROM THE PRESIDENT

About two years ago, Bedford Stuyvesant Restoration Corporation embarked on a journey to promote equity through bike share within the low income and communities of color we serve. We seized upon Citi Bike as a vehicle to further our broader community development agenda in Bedford Stuyvesant, recognizing its value in addressing health, mobility and financial challenges. After all, people must be able to get to work and school, and with a limited budget, transportation can oftentimes present a significant barrier to opportunities like employment and education. Citi Bike presented an affordable and convenient transportation alternative with obvious health benefits. Our challenge was in spurring community ownership of the program and mobilizing residents and stakeholders to get behind Citi Bike.

What followed was the birth of a successful collective impact model with partners including Citi Bike, the NYC Department of Transportation, and the NYC Department of Health and Mental Hygiene as well as scores of community based organizations, residents and elected officials. As part of a cohort of organizations working to address equity in bike share nationwide, we are excited to be a part of a movement with enormous potential for scalability and replication.

We've learned a lot along the way and wanted to share these lessons and best practices with the broader field in hopes that neighborhoods everywhere follow our lead. Our vision is that communities everywhere take advantage of this affordable and convenient transportation alternative as well as the savings and health benefits that result. Good luck and happy riding.

Sincerely,

Colvin W. Grannum



DOT is proud to be part of a great collective effort to expand bike share in Bed-Stuy, where the grassroots work of Bedford-Stuyvesant Restoration Corporation has made a real difference in getting the community to embrace bike share. As Citi Bike expands even further in 2017, we expect neighbors in other communities new to bike share to share Bed-Stuy's positive experience. That is, they will find that you just can't beat cycling as an affordable, sustainable, safe, convenient and fun way of getting around.

Polly Trottenberg, Commissioner, New York City Department of Transportation

With 14 million trips in 2016 alone, Citi Bike has become an integral part of New York's transportation network and is helping to build a more equitable, more dynamic, and more connected New York. This partnership is a model we hope to replicate in other neighborhoods across New York and in other cities Motivate serves.

Jay Walder, CEO, Motivate

Neighborhood changes rooted in the voices and values of its residents will have a lasting positive impact. Restoration's Better Bike Share Partnership is an example of the tremendous gains that can be made when this happens.

Dr. Mary T. Bassett, Commissioner, New York City Department of Health and Mental Hygiene



PART I

Executive Summary and Context

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

In 2013, Citi Bike, the nation's largest bike share system, launched in New York City. With 6,000 bikes and 332 stations, the system provided easy access to bikes in a variety of neighborhoods in Brooklyn and Manhattan, including Bedford Stuyvesant. The system was quickly a ridership success, racking up over 6 million trips in its first 7 months of operation, and 10 million and 14 million trips in each subsequent year.

But, ridership rates differed greatly by neighborhood. In particular, ridership in the Bedford Stuyvesant neighborhood of Brooklyn, a low-income neighborhood with a majority population of people of African-Caribbean descent, was well below the citywide average. Even though the area had worse health outcomes and fewer transit options than many other parts of the City, a disproportionately lower number of Bedford Stuyvesant residents were taking advantage of the mobility and health benefits of bike share.

In 2015, a grant-funded Partnership between Bedford Stuyvesant Restoration (Restoration), Motivate, the operators of the Citi Bike program, NYC Department of Transportation (DOT), and NYC Department of Health and Mental Hygiene (DOHMH), formed to address the issue. Coalescing largely around Citi Bike's potential as a tool to improve health outcomes and mobility opportunities for the residents of Bedford Stuyvesant, the Restoration Partnership saw clear results.

A significant increase in Citi Bike trips in Bedford Stuyvesant:

- More than 170,000 more trips in 2016 than in 2015
- 225% more trips in June 2015 than in June 2016
- 70% more trips in September 2016 (New York's peak cycling month) than September 2015
- More Citi Bike trips in January 2016, the dead of winter, than in June 2015.
- Overall ridership growth in Bedford Stuyvesant above the citywide average.

Increases in Citi Bike membership in Bedford Stuyvesant and membership growing at a faster rate than the city as a whole:

- A 56% increase in members vs a 46% increase citywide from March 2015 to December 2016
- NYCHA resident enrollments grew at a faster rate in Bedford Stuyvesant than anywhere else in the city from March 2015 to September 2016

Strong response to Restoration Partnership engagement efforts:

- Over 2,500 participants in Partnership events in 2015 & 2016
- 3 high profile Bed-Stuy Bikes! Community events
- 5 stakeholder convenings and trainings with almost 200 participants in 2016
- 84 community-led group rides with over 445 participants in 2016

The success of the Restoration Partnership is based on its organizing approach and the strong physical foundation provided by the Citi Bike system itself. The Partnership was led by Restoration, a community-based development corporation with 50 years of established trust in the community. Partnership programming was woven into existing programming, showing local residents how Citi Bike could serve them in their daily lives - getting to grocery stores and farmers markets, to financial services or classes at Restoration, or as part of recreational, fun activities hosted by local groups. The Partnership used the two system expansions - in August of 2015 and 2016 - to build momentum. The August 2015 system expansion was particularly crucial to the Partnership's work because it more than doubled the number of stations in Bedford Stuyvesant and surrounding neighborhoods, increasing Citi Bike's usefulness for a wider variety of trips.

The Partners were also keenly aware that their work would have to address perceptions of Citi Bike and change the pervasive sentiment that the system was "not intended for" people of color. In two years the Partnership hosted over 84 community rides and 3 *Bed-Stuy Bikes!* events, reaching over 2,500 Bedford Stuyvesant residents. Community and internal champions stepped up to significantly improve both Citi Bike's image and its programmatic offerings in ways that increased access and attractiveness for low-income people and people of color.

The experience of the Restoration Partnership holds core lessons for other groups and individuals working to address community health and mobility needs and to make cycling and bike share relevant to a wider audience. Over the past two years Citi Bike membership and ridership in Bedford Stuyvesant have increased significantly. These increases are tied to the Partnership's work. Overall, the Partnership is changing the face of who rides in Bedford Stuyvesant, encouraging more people to use Citi Bike for commutes and pleasure, and giving long-time residents new ownership over changing streets and new safety infrastructure.

As the NACTO Board President and the Transportation General Manager of a city that cares deeply about equitable transportation outcomes, I applaud Restoration for giving us such a powerful example of what a thoughtful, equity-focused partnership can do. Restoration's work, and the ability of their Partnership to significantly increase the number of people riding in their community, has direct implications for anyone working on bike share, cycling, and active transportation nationwide.

Seleta Reynolds, General Manager, LA DOT, NACTO Board President



SYSTEM IMPLEMENTATION



10



. Walker, Jr. Healthcare Center orating 15.Years re Service to our Community



12

BEDFORD STUYVESANT IN CONTEXT

While rapidly changing, Bedford Stuyvesant is a neighborhood in Central Brooklyn populated primarily by people of African and Caribbean descent. Like many New Yorkers, Bedford Stuyvesant residents have faced enormous financial and housing pressures over the past 15 years. Citywide, the population has grown by almost half a million people, and housing construction has not matched pace. For subway-accessible neighborhoods like Bedford Stuyvesant that are relatively close to New York's Manhattan business core, this has meant a heavy population increase, especially from white New Yorkers priced out of other neighborhoods.¹

This population growth has had direct financial impacts on Bedford Stuyvesant residents. On average, rents in Bedford Stuyvesant increased 40% from 2010 and 2014, as opposed to decreasing by almost 3% from 1990 to 2000.² While Bedford Stuyvesant is the eighth poorest neighborhood in New York City, parts of the neighborhood have seen extreme increases in home prices. The western part of Bedford Stuyvesant, which has better subway access, saw home values almost triple since 2005, the greatest increase in home prices in the country. The median value of a single family home in the area is now over \$1 million.³ While the city's economy has largely recovered from the 2008 financial crash which directly eliminated over 100,000 jobs in New York City alone, the economic scars still remain.⁴

The past decade has also seen major policy changes at the city level, especially around transportation.⁵ Up until 2007, the City's investment in local street infrastructure was primarily focused on maintenance and in-kind replacement of street markings. But in 2007, New York City began to re-think its policies and efforts in light of two major challenges: the massive projected population growth and climate change. The projected population growth–half a million more people by 2030–would swamp existing housing and transportation capacity. Rising sea levels would wreak havoc on coastal cities like New York, a fact that was made starkly clear in 2004 in New Orleans after Hurricane Katrina.

To meet these challenges, the City began ramping up its sustainability efforts and dramatically changing its streets.⁶ In particular, since driving produces ¼ of all greenhouse gases nationally, increasing



street efficiency and offering New Yorkers more and better access to walking, biking, and public transit was seen as an essential area of focus.⁷

The infrastructure changes were not always perceived of positively. For some long-term Bedford Stuyvesant residents, the changes were seen to be in service of incoming, increasingly white, residents, rather than to the neighborhood's predominantly African American and low-income residents. White residents in Bedford Stuyvesant increased from 2.4% in 2000 to 15% by 2010.⁸ The inflow of new residents increased competition for basic neighborhood amenities such as sidewalk space, parking spaces, and local parks. Elsewhere in the city, small groups of wealthy, well-connected people were leading opposition to new transportation projects, especially bike lanes. By the late 2000's and early 2010's, the city's housing crunch and population growth, compounded by the economic crash and systemic racial tensions and inequities, were coming to a head with biking as a key hot button issue.

In 2013, New York City launched the nation's largest bike share program to provide New Yorkers with a new way to get around. Citi Bike opened with 6,000 bicycles, spread over 332 stations in Manhattan and Brooklyn. Subsequent expansions in 2015 and 2016 increased the program to 10,000 bikes and 600 stations in Brooklyn, Manhattan, and Queens, and the system is slated to grow to 12,000 bikes by the end of 2017.

Of 332 stations initially placed around the city, ten were installed in Bedford Stuyvesant, the original eastern-most border of the system. The system coverage was dictated by a planning principle that kept stations close together to ensure high-quality service. In addition, a limited funding source, and the loss of 1,000 bikes worth of equipment during Hurricane Sandy, also restricted the geographic reach of the initial roll-out. But in an already tense climate, being on the periphery of the system seemed another indication that Bedford Stuyvesant was an afterthought. Additionally, while riders could travel to the (whiter) neighborhoods to the north and west using Citi Bike, neighborhoods to the east and south frequented by Bedford Stuyvesant residents did not have docking stations. As a result of these and other factors, Citi Bike had limited appeal to many neighborhood residents and was received with active resistance from some.



PART II

Building Brooklyn's Better Bike Share Partnership

CHANGING THE CONVERSATION

We wanted to change neighborhood conversation from focusing on gentrification to exploring how bike share can help residents achieve their personal goals. Changing the conversation meant real discussions with residents on their perceptions and aspirations and it also required Partnership members to do business differently -including looking at our own organizational practices, how we engage the community and how we collaborate with one another.

Tracey Capers, Bedford Stuyvesant Restoration In 2014, Motivate, the new Citi Bike operator, approached Bedford Stuyvesant Restoration Corporation (Restoration), to join them in a grant application to the Better Bike Share Partnership (BBSP) to fund work that would increase the number of low-income people and people of color using Citi Bike in Bedford Stuyvesant. The application came in preparation for a planned Citi Bike expansion that would more than double the number of stations in Bedford Stuyvesant. The proposal was soon rounded out by the addition of two more founding partners, the New York City Departments of Transportation (DOT) and Health and Mental Hygiene (DOHMH), both of whom had a long-standing involvement in the Citi Bike program. The goals of the grant were to increase bike share usage in Bedford Stuyvesant and support the physical and financial health of its residents.⁹

Restoration, the nation's oldest community development corporation, and a trusted anchor in the community with a 50-year track record, was the logical choice to lead the effort. Restoration had a strong cultural and institutional know-how that would help navigate issues of perception and community integration facing Citi Bike. Restoration's interest in Citi Bike came from recognizing that bike share could be a tool to address health disparities in Bedford Stuyvesant, where obesity and diabetes rates were significantly higher than citywide averages.¹⁰ As the lead coordinator for the *Partnership for a Healthier Brooklyn*, a collaborative intervention by the DOHMH, Restoration was already deeply invested in improving health outcomes in Bedford Stuyvesant and was looking for innovative ways to increase activity levels among local residents.

In April 2015, Restoration was awarded one of six BBSP Challenge Grants. In addition to funding the work of the Restoration Partnership, the \$75,000 BBSP grant allowed Restoration to leverage minigrant funding from DOHMH, which it used to bring smaller local organizations into the Partnership as sub-grantees.

ASSESSING THE COMMUNITY

The Partnership's first two orders of business were to decide how they would measure success and to get a better understanding of how Bedford Stuyvesant residents used Citi Bike and what barriers stood in their way.



To measure the efficacy of their work, the Partners selected simple metrics - membership and ridership growth and participation in Citi Bike's affordability programs. Initially, each Partner brought slightly different agendas to the table, but all agreed that a few fundamental metrics could serve as indicators for a variety of desired outcomes. In particular, the focus on trips reflected their understanding that Citi Bike's health and mobility benefits could only be realized if people were riding. The Partnership established a data dashboard to collect Citi Bike trip and membership data, an invaluable resource that helped them monitor progress and to build trust between the partners.

To measure neighborhood awareness, perceptions, and experience with Citi Bike, Restoration, in partnership with DOHMH, developed an intercept survey. Restoration hired several Community Ambassadors and other teenagers from the city's Summer Youth Employment Program (SYEP) to collect survey information from over 230 Bedford Stuyvesant residents over the summer of 2015. The survey data augmented information collected from 30 neighborhood residents in four DOHMH-facilitated focus groups in the fall to create a more nuanced understanding of resident reactions to Citi Bike. Taken together, the information served as a baseline and informed the Partnership's engagement strategies.

The surveys showed that almost everyone in Bedford Stuyvesant (87%) had heard of Citi Bike, but few people (18%) had used it. Nearly one third (32%) disagreed with the statement that the Citi Bike was "intended for people like me," even though three fourths (74%) agreed that they would like have a Citi Bike station near where they lived and 36% of residents reported riding a bike in the past year. There was almost no awareness (9%) of the existing discounted an-

nual membership option for NYCHA residents.

In particular, two approaches emerged from the focus groups and surveys as ways to increase Citi Bike ridership in Bedford Stuyvesant:

- Improved and increased infrastructure: increase the number of Citi Bike stations in and around Bedford Stuyvesant and make local streets safer places to ride.
- Enhance and target programming: focus on engaging local residents, diversifying Citi Bike promotional materials to better represent the community, offering biking education classes, and increase messaging about different membership and payment options.

Shared measurement of data has been a key element of this Partnership. Engaging community members helped us gather and use data and have a collective understanding on what systems changes are necessary to increase equitable practices in bike sharing programs.

Phil Noyes, DOHMH



GETTING STARTED

The success metrics and findings from the intercept surveys and focus groups gave the Partnership a clear direction. For DOT and Motivate, this meant a concentrated focus on infrastructure. In the summer of 2015, a long-awaited system expansion began, increasing the number of stations in Bedford Stuyvesant from 10 to 36 and expanding the coverage area significantly to the east.

At the same time, perceptions that membership was too expensive, along with lack of awareness amongst NYCHA residents about discount options, highlighted educational and programmatic opportunities for the Partners. In particular, Motivate accelerated plans to offer a monthly payment option both to the NYCHA discount and the general membership plan. For NY-CHA residents, and members of participating community development credit unions, this change lowered a financial barrier by shifting the cost of an annual membership from upfront cost of \$60/year to \$5/month. To publicize this new option, Citi Bike developed bi-lingual brochures and placed banners on stations adjacent to NYCHA developments throughout 2016.



Banners on stations near NYCHA buildings announce the \$5/month membership option.

FOSTERING COMMUNITY OWNERSHIP

Helping the community to feel ownership for Citi Bike in Bedford Stuyvesant, perhaps the hardest task, fell largely to Restoration. Restoration began by integrating Citi Bike into its existing community programming. For example, Restoration worked with Motivate to re-purpose the existing Corporate Membership program to provide Citi Bike memberships to low-income people receiving job training and financial counseling at the Restoration Economic Solution Center.

The Partnership also focused on ways that Citi Bike could support other community organizations. Allocating \$40,000 from a longstanding DOHMH grant, Restoration created a secondary mini-grant program to fund other local partners. For the first round of mini-grants, Restoration selected the Brooklyn Cooperative Credit Union and the Bedford Stuyvesant YMCA. The mini-grants quickly proved their worth. For example, the YMCA created a Citi Bike ambassador manual, providing the Partnership with a training guide for future ambassadors and volunteers. The Brooklyn Cooperative Federal Credit Union increased the promotion of the \$5/month annual Citi Bike membership option available to its members and used their 4,000-member mailing list to distribute Citi Bike promotional materials.¹¹

With the survey results showing that only one in five Bedford Stuyvesant residents (18%) had ever used

Bed Stuy's Better Bike Share Partnership has demonstrated that bike share can thrive in low income and communities of color. We have witnessed first-hand the program bolster the business community, benefiting both residents and visitors alike. Having had the opportunity to lead several bike rides throughout the neighborhood's numerous historical and commercial places of interest, what strikes me most is the sense of community ownership and pride that is resulting from the program.

Robert Cornegy, New York City Councilmember

Citi Bike, Restoration also worked to foster community ownership by providing residents with more opportunities to try it. For example, throughout 2015 and 2016 Restoration hosted Community Rides around the neighborhood and provided Citi Bikes to participants without bikes.

CHAMPIONS STEP UP

Over the course of 2015, Tracey Capers, Restoration's Executive Vice President for Programs, emerged as its biggest champion, both in her role as the Partnership coordinator and internally at Restoration itself. A Citi Bike convert herself, Capers had come to conceptualize Citi Bike as a tool to help Restoration address long-standing health and mobility disparities and was excited to find ways to use Citi Bike to further Restoration's work.

Capers' high profile championship brought in new resources and created more champions. For example, for the 2016 Community Rides, Motivate and Restoration decided to look for local residents, community groups, and stakeholders to co-host and lead the rides. Capers personally recruited many of the ride leaders, including City Councilmember Robert Cornegy and Assemblyman Walter Mosley, using her own connections to key neighborhood stakeholders and Restoration's strong institutional reputation in the community. Other champions also emerged, such as Bedford Stuyvesant native, Kweli Campbell, another Citi Bike convert who led six Community Rides and devoted countless additional hours explaining Citi Bike to anyone who flagged her down as she rode around the neighborhood on her daily commute.

Led by local champions, the Partnership's 2016 Community Rides were an unmitigated success. From May to October, over 330 Bedford Stuyvesant residents joined the Partnership on one of 47 rides using Citi Bikes and personal bikes. Co-hosting the rides increased awareness of and media coverage. By tapping their own networks, the co-hosts also helped to attract people who would otherwise not have considered trying Citi Bike. For example, people who were involved in Restoration's healthy eating programming were attracted to the Community Ride to the farmers market. The Community Ride co-hosted by Black Girls Do Bike, a group with national affiliates, garnered significant local press and



was featured in a nationally circulated StreetFilms shortie.¹² The ride led by the Phi Beta Sigma fraternity tapped its local alumni network. Restoration also hosted rides to get to events for which they already had programming like job trainings or breast feeding awareness.

Multi-faceted programing and co-hosts were also key to the success of other Partnership events such as the *Bed-Stuy Bikes!* series. For example, the August 2016 *Bed-Stuy Bikes! Back to School Edition*, featured free backpacks and school supplies from Fidelis Care, in addition to the standard DOT helmet give-away, learn-to-ride classes on Citi Bikes, free flu shots and health screenings from Interfaith and Woodhull, bike safety classes, organized rides, food, kid-friendly community programing like cooking and exercise classes, face painting and arts & crafts, and DJ. Over the course of 2016, the Partnership reached over 1,500 residents through rides and other programming.

"PEOPLE WHO LOOK LIKE ME"

Focusing on the survey results from 2015 that found that 32% of respondents felt that Citi Bike was not "for people like me," and that seeing people who looked like them riding Citi Bike might be an influencing factor in membership purchase for 35% of respondents, the Partnership also set out to increase the visibility of people of color on Citi Bikes.

As a first move, Restoration created a series of Citi Bike-specific visuals for their existing healthy activity ad campaign, #FreshMovesBKNY. Whereas previous iterations of the campaign featured the importance of drinking water or healthy eating, the Citi Bike-focused ads featured Bedford Stuyvesant residents of color who used Citi Bike, and highlighted their personal stories about why they joined and why they rode. The ads were placed in Bedford Stuyvesant subway stations, on local buses and bus shelters, and ran in targeted papers such as *The Amsterdam News*, *Brooklyn Courier*, *CaribNews*, *Caribbean Life*, and *Our Times Press*.

Again, local champions played a key role in helping to paint a new picture of ridership in the area. For example, in 2015, Shaquana Boykin, MARP's Program Manager of the Healthy Communities Initiative, began making her frequent neighborhood trips by Citi Bike. Boykin quickly became a known figure on a bike, traversing Bedford Stuyvesant daily to run events at the local Farmers' Market, pick up and distribute DOHMH Health Bucks to make it easier for people with EBT cards to buy fresh fruits and

vegetables, restock supplies at the nearby Fort Greene & Farragut Fresh Pantry, and talk to community members about nutritional education and healthy shopping and cooking choices. Like Campbell, Boykin is often stopped by residents who have questions about Citi Bike or want to tell her that she has inspired them to join. The Partnership capitalized on Boykin's local fame by featuring her in the #FreshMovesBKNY campaign and naming her the Mayor of the Washington Park station.

EXPANDING THE PARTNERSHIP

In March 2016 the national BBSP awarded the Restoration Partnership a second round of \$75,000 grant funding in recognition of the exceptional work happening in Bedford Stuyvesant. Restoration was one of two organizations to receive funding for a second year. With Restoration, and Capers in particular, leading the way, The Better Bike Share Partnership chose to award Challenge Grants to Restoration twice because of its strong network of partners, commitment to and knowledge of the community, and willingness to think creatively to expand access to bike share.

Zoe Kircos, BBSP Challenge Grants Director

the Partnership took advantage of this opportunity to expand their work. In addition to the BBSP funding, the Partnership used the remaining mini-grant funding to bring in three new local partners-the Myrtle Ave Revitalization Project (MARP), Interfaith Hospital, and Woodhull Medical Center.

With the national BBSP's focus on employer-based strategies, the three new organizations joined Citi Bike's Corporate Membership program, purchasing packages of discounted memberships which they distributed to their employees. Interfaith Medical Center, for example, committed to purchasing 55 partial subsidy memberships and 20 full subsidy memberships. To support their efforts, Interfaith and Woodhull also launched aggressive recruitment campaigns to enroll employees. As a result, Citi Bike's Corporate Membership program in Brooklyn expanded substantially, with 50% of new corporate partners attributed to the work of the Partnership.

Structurally, the Corporate Membership program offered an opportunity for the Partnership to leverage an existing institutional framework (employers) to reach people for whom Citi Bike might have a big impact. The hospitals are both large employers who hire extensively from the Bedford Stuyvesant community, and MARP supports many small local businesses along the Myrtle Avenue corridor. Many of their employees face the same health and financial challenges as the community at large. To date, 71% of Interfaith employees who have joined Citi Bike via the Corporate Membership program are people of color.¹³

The success of the Corporate Membership program also came from the longstanding relationships between the hospitals and Restoration. Initially, Restoration put out a request-for-proposal to solicit mini-grant partners, but only MARP applied. It was only when Capers made personal calls to the key influencers she knew, Benjamin Gonzalez at Interfaith and Dr. Edward Fishkin at Woodhull, that the hospitals joined the Partnership. The existing relationships also made actual program implementation easier because the partners were known entities and the Partnership could shape potential programming to match existing hospital services. Importantly, by including Woodhull, a public hospital in the New York City Health and Hospital Corporation (H+H) system, the Partnership hopes to create a model that can be replicated in other H+H hospitals citywide.



I've always seen people of color biking in Bedford Stuyvesant. As biking gets more popular in New York, bike share access improves in our neighborhoods, and organizations like Restoration mobilize community support, more and more people of color in Bedford Stuyvesant and beyond are seeing biking as a viable transportation option.

Kweli Campbell

LEVERAGING PARTNERS FOR NEW PROGRAMS

In coordination with the 2016 Citi Bike expansion, Restoration and Motivate set out to address the lack of knowledge about Citi Bike among NYCHA residents. While the NYCHA discount membership has existed since Citi Bike's launch, and NYCHA management was involved heavily in station siting discussions around their properties, only 9% of Bedford Stuyvesant residents knew about the NYCHA discount and NYCHA resident ridership was relatively low.

Leveraging Restoration's Economic Solutions Center, Motivate made a renewed effort to reach out to NYCHA residents. Citi Bike's Education and Outreach Manager, Anne Krassner, developed a NYCHA Champions program, leveraging the job-training programming to hire five NYCHA residents. During the fall of 2016, these NYCHA Champions participated in 7 events and rides to enroll new Citi Bike members. Motivate also stepped up targeted promotions, advertising in the NYCHA journal, tapping into NYCHA's social media channels, attending tenant association meetings, and tabling at NYCHA "family day" festivals throughout the warmer months.

Preliminary membership data suggests that these efforts are increasing awareness for Citi Bike among NYCHA residents. While enrollment in Citi Bike discount memberships has been steadily increasing, the growth since late spring 2016 has been markedly higher in Bedford Stuyvesant than in Brooklyn or citywide.

The *Citi Bike for Youth* programming was also the result of leveraged coordination between the Partners. In 2015, Restoration hired teenagers in the Summer Youth Employment Program (SYEP) to serve as program ambassadors and conduct intercept surveys. SYEP participants were powerful reminders that youth could be willing first adopters and persuasive champions. With this in mind, Motivate moved forward with plans to launch the youth-focused membership program, *Citi Bike for Youth* program. The program, which provided a free annual Citi Bike membership to 41 teenagers, including 17 participants in Restoration's youth employment program, targeted low-income 16-24 year olds in community based career development programs. Motivate plans to continue expanding this program in 2017. The constant communication between the Partners allowed them to build off each other's successes. For example, DOHMH used *Citi Bike for Youth* as a foundation for their long-envisioned "bike to school" programming.¹⁴ DOHMH purchased a small quantity of Citi Bike memberships and gave them to participating high school students. While the program is still very small, with 8 participating students, DOHMH hopes to expand to a citywide policy that entitles all high school students to an annual Citi Bike membership in the same way they receive a Metro Card.

DOHMH's *Prescribe-a-Bike* program is another example of programming made possible by the collective power of the Partnership. Loosely based off a similar program in Boston, DOHHM worked with Interfaith to identify and train heath care providers who would prescribe a free bike share membership to patients who needed to increase their physical activity levels. DOHMH cites Interfaith's strong institutional foundation and existing array of out-patient community health programing as factors that make them an ideal partner for this kind of programming. DOHMH is tracking utilization among members: in the first six months over 40 Interfaith patients and providers have signed up for Citi Bike memberships. Interfaith participants have ridden Citi Bike 520 times. Woodhull will start a *Prescribe-a-Bike* program in 2017.



Community engagement of residents and partners is key when rolling out new programming. The Restoration Partnership made it easy to engage with community members because of their strong existing relationships.

Maggie Veatch, DOHMH



24

Bike New York instructors use Citi Bikes to teach Bedford Stuyvesant residents how to ride at a Bed Stuy Bikes! event.

PART III

Results and Lessons Learned

SUCCESS ON THE GROUND

The number of Citi Bike trips in Bedford Stuyvesant increased dramatically over the term of the Partnership's work. This increase in trips means that more people saved time, realized new opportunities for exercise and health, and found it easier to travel around the neighborhood. Bedford Stuyvesant saw 225% more Citi Bike trips in June 2016 than in June 2015, and 70% more Citi Bike trips in September 2016, New York's typical peak cycling month, than in September 2015. There were more Citi Bike trips in Bedford Stuyvesant in January of 2016, the dead of winter, than in June of the prior year. In total, there were more than 170,000 more Citi Bike trips in Bedford Stuyvesant in 2016 than in 2015.

Across the system, Citi Bike posted record ridership numbers in 2016–14 million trips, half the total number of bike share trips in the US–and repeatedly broke through single-day trip records. Throughout 2016, the growth in the number of trips increased faster in Bedford Stuyvesant than the city as a whole, suggesting that the Partnership's targeted work is having a direct impact.

Similarly, membership rates in Bedford Stuyvesant are also growing faster than the citywide average. By December 2016, Citi Bike membership in Bedford Stuyvesant had increased by 56% in comparison to a 46% increase for the system as a whole.¹⁵ In particular, the focused effort on NYCHA seems to be having an impact. While NYCHA residents continue to represent a small percent of total Citi Bike members, since Fall 2015 NYCHA enrollments have grown at a faster rate in Brooklyn than citywide, and a faster rate in Bedford Stuyvesant than in Brooklyn overall.

With local champions like Campbell and Boykin, and new daily riders like Capers herself, perceptions of Citi Bike in Bedford Stuyvesant have also improved. To better measure how the work of the Partnership has impacted the image of bike share and riding in Bedford Stuyvesant, the Partnership hopes to repeat the original intercept surveys in the coming year.





Media attention to the Partnership's work has also picked up, amplifying successes. In 2016, Restoration and the work of the Partnership was featured in over a dozen different local and national media outlets, including articles in the New York Times, DNAInfo, City Lab, Brooklyn Reader, Brooklyn Eagle, AMNY, Politico, the news channel NY1, and StreetFilms. This coverage was in addition to numerous stories and blog posts on the Citi Bike, Restoration, and national Better Bike Share Partnership websites.

The Partnership has been spotlighted at national and local conferences and events, including the 2016 NACTO Designing Cities Conference, the Better Bike Share Partnership Conference, NABSA's 2016 Annual Meeting, and NYU Rudin Transportation Center's panel on "The Future of Citi Bike: Assuring Access to Low-Income Communities." The Partnership also joined forces to elevate the profile of women who bike and advocate for bike share, joining NYC DOT Commissioner Polly Trottenberg at the Women's Bike Month Celebration. More recently, Boykin and several other Partnership members provided expert testimony at the December 2016 City Council Hearing calling for expansion of the Citi Bike system.









Community engagement has always been a priority for DOT's bike share planning work. This partnership with Restoration inspired us to reexamine what we had been doing, and to look for new, creative strategies - like the pop-up workshops - that could help us reach more people.

Beth Heyde, NYC DOT

A DEEPER ENGAGEMENT

Within the partner organizations themselves, engagement with the Partnership has encouraged a deeper engagement with equity issues in all aspects of their work. DOT enhanced its station siting engagement efforts in other parts of the city, adding pop-up workshops at subway stations and in local parks, based on the positive results of the Partnership's work. In addition, planning staff from other DOT units who implement safety projects citywide, have started to attend Partnership meetings to learn about engagement strategies.

At Motivate, Communications Director, Dani Simons, has helped funnel time and resources to the Partnership's efforts. Krassner's role has honed in on operationalizing equitable system expansion and funding is being allocated for a new, equity-focused staff position. In October 2016, Motivate CEO, Jay Walder was honored at the Restoration Gala for Motivate's work toward institutionalizing equity into their fundamental business values.

For DOHMH, the Partnership has helped demonstrate what a successful partnership can look like. DOHMH staff have been able to leverage the Partnership's work to integrate cycling into the larger tent of public health solutions. For example, DOHMH's Harlem District office attended the December Partnership gathering at Restoration, and DOHMH, Motivate, and Restoration hope to replicate their successes in Bedford Stuyvesant as the Citi Bike expands into Harlem and beyond.

At Restoration, the Partnership has unlocked new opportunities, helping them provide financial and health services to an even wider array of people. Incorporating Citi Bike rides into workforce development programming has created new ways to help people save time and money getting to jobs and interviews. Restoration financial counselors use Citi Bike in their workshop discussions as an example of how to save money. Support for this programming has spread throughout the organization and Restoration is now embarking on a demonstration pilot with NYC Department of Consumer Affairs, to use Citi Bike as an intervention tool to reduce transportation costs in northern Bedford Stuyvesant, an area where poverty rates and health disparities are highest and transit service is limited.

CHAMPIONS MATTER

Rallying local champions who rode frequently throughout the community was perhaps the single most important factor in changing perceptions about Citi Bike within Bedford Stuyvesant. Community champions like Campbell and Boykin, and community-based organizations like Black Girls Do Bike, Brooklyn Alliance for Safer Streets, have helped put a human face on Citi Bike. Enthusiastic, approachable, and persistent, these local advocates have helped to change the perception of who Citi Bike is "for" and provide an opportunity for residents to ask question to a relatable person.

At the same time, high-level internal advocates made the Partnership possible. These key supporters helped build buy-in and acceptance for Partnership programming within their respective institutions. At Restoration, Capers leveraged key personal and institutional resources and built internal momentum and support for the project by developing ways to build Citi Bike into a wider scope of Restoration programming. In interviews, every member of the Partnership identified Capers' leadership - challenging and inspiring partners to do more, and holding them accountable to their commitments - as fundamental to success. At DOHMH, constant pressure from Maggie Veatch and Phil Noyes helped unlock additional resources. At DOT, attention from Beth Heyde helped corral resources from disparate DOT divisions and focused attention on the importance of earlier engagement work, lessons that are being applied as the Citi Bike expansion planning continues.

ORGANIZING, NOT MARKETING

Key to the success of the Partnership was their decision to frame Citi Bike in ways that provided solutions to the concerns faced by low-income people in Bedford Stuyvesant, such as unemployment, housing displacement, and financial insecurity. The Partners chose programming and strategies that demonstrated how Citi Bike could be integral rather than tangential to meeting the community's needs and goals.

For example, Motivate hired local residents and used Restoration's Economic Solutions Center to recruit for Citi Bike NYCHA Champion jobs. Community rides, such as a ride to the farmers market, helped showcase existing services. *Bed Stuy Bikes!* events appealed to a wide audience by bringing together a range of activities and services-from flu shots to cooking classes to free bike helmets-with Citi Bikes

available for guided rides and Bike New York learn-toride classes. Citi Bikes were made available to workforce development program participants to help them get to work and interviews, and to classes offered by Restoration and other service providers. New and prospective Citi Bike members were linked up with Restoration's financial counselors to get banked, or learn ways that their savings could be rechanneled into other budget needs. Teenagers in Restoration's summer employment programing were tapped to be inaugural participants in *Citi Bike for Youth*.

The Partnership also made Citi Bike relevant on a personal as well as programmatic level. For example, while Boykin became an ardent Citi Bike support and champion, her motivation to join had nothing to do with bikes. Rather, her impetus was personal health and Citi Bike allowed To make Citi Bike more reflective of the community it serves, we realized we needed to think about this work more from an organizing perspective than a traditional marketing problem. That's why working in this partnership has been such a powerful opportunity.

Dani Simons, Motivate

The first day, I biked to work, biked to New York City College of Technology, back to work, and then to Target in Atlantic terminal. At my next doctor's visit, I was told I lost five pounds, and I never stopped biking.

Shaquana Boykin, MARP



her to meet her health goals. Similarly, Capers, not a Citi Bike user when the Partnership began, quickly saw how Citi Bike could help her - getting to off-site locations on the other side of Bedford Stuyvesant, and exercise - and became one of its strongest champions.

BUILD FROM A STRONG FOUNDATION

The success also comes from the strength of its core partner, Restoration. Restoration's long history in Bedford Stuyvesant, as an organization that fights for neighborhood needs, brought credibility, energy, and power to the Partnership. This institutional infrastructure, with long-standing relationships with other neighborhood players already in place, allowed the Partnership to work quickly and efficiently, tapping other local resources and networks as needed. For example, the success of the 2016 Community rides came from Capers' ability to call on her existing contacts in Bedford Stuyvesant. Similarly, later programming, like DOHMH's *Prescribe-A-Bike* built on already solid interactions between DOHMH, Restoration, and Interfaith. Proposing ideas and addressing challenges was easier because the relationships were already established.

At the same time, the success of the Partnership at increasing ridership was also made possible by the physical foundation provided by the Citi Bike system itself. The 26 new stations in Bedford Stuyvesant and expanded program area allowed riders to get to more places and addressed a known barrier - "no stations or bikes where I want to go" - to bike share use. The City's longstanding access-focused planning commitment - that Citi Bike users, regardless of neighborhood or income-level, would never have to walk further than 3-5 minutes to get to a bike - meant that the service remained a useful, convenient option as it expanded further into low-income areas.

TRUST TAKES TIME

While the Partnership promised significant positive gains for the community and participating organizations, the capacities and cultures differed between the bureaucracies of larger public partners and the grassroots orientation of smaller community-based partners. Taking the time to build trust between the organizations was necessary for the Partnership to succeed. In particular, the data dashboard helped the partners understand what the others were doing and monitor progress overall. The dashboard collected membership and ridership information, and document the collective impact of partner interventions. Data was used to both inform new outreach strategies and community programs, and to help partners learn from their successes and failures. In addition, the Partnership instituted monthly meetings to build trust among the partners and help them better understand and leverage individual capacities.

Importantly, in 2014, when Motivate approached Restoration to be a grant partner, they were not a stranger. Throughout 2013, Restoration, in partnership with DOHMH, hosted weekly "*Run, Bike, Walk*" events, with Citi Bike providing "Community Keys" to participants Regularly scheduled meetings are really important. Trust can't happen if you only schedule a meeting when there's a problem.

Maggie Veatch, DOHMH

Monthly meetings to review data and share best practices have ensured the success of the partnership.

Ben Gonzalez, Interfaith

without bikes. Restoration had also been selected by DOHMH as the borough lead for a separate 2012 Centers for Disease Control grant to address neighborhood health disparities. Nor was DOT a new face when they joined in supporting the grant application and partnership. In 2012, Restoration worked with the DOT to conduct planning workshops with neighborhood residents to help select locations for the first round of Citi Bike stations.

MONEY MATTERS

The need to compensate people and organizations for their time starts at the top and goes all the way down the chain. The BBSP grant enabled Restoration to hire a full-time staff member dedicated to the Citi Bike expansion in Bedford Stuyvesant. Restoration also was able to align the BBSP grant with the overall agenda of its DOHMH-funded Partnership for a Healthier Brooklyn, designed to tackle health disparities. Its leadership position with the Partnership enabled Restoration to leverage a broader team of support from DOHMH, as well as additional support for local mini-grants.

The work of the Partnership required funding beyond the \$150,000 (\$75,000 in each grant cycle) provided by the BBSP Challenge grant program. In particular, early in-kind support from DOT and DOHMH was critical to success. In addition, the \$40,000 mini-grant funding provided by DOHMH brought in additional partners. The grant funding helped cover the cost of staff, and provided the five participating organizations with an incentive to invest time and resources and the financial security to be able to take their seat at the table.

Nor is the need for compensation limited to the organizational level. A growing body of research nationally suggests that, especially in low-income areas, paying residents to participate in programming can help improve equitable outcomes, as people on limited budgets typically have the least time to devote to volunteer activities. To this end, the NYCHA Champions program both creates jobs for local residents and galvanizes local support for bike share. Hiring teenagers via the *Citi Bike for Youth* program helped develop a generation of new champions and helped those teenagers gain meaningful professional experience. Motivate has increasingly made local community-based hiring a priority and is continuing to work with Restoration and workforce development organizations like Workforce One, the Henry and Grand Street Settlements, and Recycle-A-Bicycle to hire seasonal and permanent staff.



PART IV

Goals for 2017 and Beyond The concentrated engagement and organizing efforts of the Restoration Partnership have changed the picture of who bikes in Bedford Stuyvesant in tangible, countable ways. These lessons are powerful and replicable.

As the Partnership looks forward to 2017 and beyond, the following goals are in their sights:

SUPPORT CITI BIKE'S EXPANSION BEYOND 12,000 BIKES

In 2016, Citi Bike posted record ridership numbers–14 million trips, or half of all bike share trips taken in the U.S. Estimates suggest that Citi Bike trips make up as many as 1/3 of all bike trips in the program area. The overwhelming support for Citi Bike by New Yorkers who "vote with their pedals" has spurred calls for Citi Bike to expand well beyond the 12,000 bikes current planned.

The **Partnership supports efforts to expand Citi Bike beyond 12,000 bikes** and commends NYC Councilmember Ydanis Rodriquez for leading the charge for expansion.

REPLICATE THE PARTNERSHIP SUCCESSES IN OTHER NYC NEIGHBORHOODS

In December 2016, Restoration convened other community-based organizations to catalyze a Better Bike Share movement throughout New York City. In addition, Restoration has committed to providing technical assistance to nascent programs in East Harlem, Red Hook, and Crown Heights.

More recently, Motivate, together with Restoration, has secured \$200,000 from the New York State Health Foundation to **replicate the Partnership's work in the East Harlem and Two Bridges neighborhoods**. The Partnership will look to augment this funding with other sources in order to maximize the impact of their work.



It's clear Citi Bike has become much more than a neighborhood amenity, with thousands now relying on it as a legitimate transportation option.

Ydanis Rodriguez, New York City Councilmember

EXPAND THE UNDERSTANDING OF EQUITY AND DEFINING METRICS

While strides have been made, the Partnership looks to continue to push the discussion on equity and seeks to foster agency, ownership and voice in low-income communities across the city. Leveraging technical assistance made available by the DOHMH and funding from the Centers for Disease Control, **the Partnership hosted a March 2017 convening with PolicyLink**, a non-profit focused on advancing economic and social equity.

Equitable bike share is nuanced and multi-faceted. It includes decisions about pricing and affordability, station placement, hiring practices that make sure neighborhood residents are considered for bike share jobs at all levels, targeting resources to safe places to bike, and measuring and shifting perception and other barriers to utilization. Data and metrics are needed to understand what works and what should change.

Building off a 2016 NACTO article that proposed an outline for measuring equity, the **Restoration Partnership looks to flesh out specific metrics that will help them, and others, better understand what success looks like.**¹⁶ As part of this effort, the Partnership will continue to study equity and improve its data collection effort, potentially re-running intercept surveys and focus groups, to help create a national model for successful, equitable bike share.

CONTINUE THE PUSH FOR EQUITY-FOCUSED BIKE SHARE POLICY

Ensuring equitable access to the benefits of bike share for low income neighborhoods of color is a key driver for the Restoration Partnership. As the Partnership moves forward, equity must stay at the fore.

Persistent and sustained engagement has been the hallmark of the Partnership's work over the past two years. Looking forward, the Partnership looks to continue that creativity to reach into new policy areas. In particular, **the Partnership supports City efforts that position bike share as a way to help address larger economic challenges**. Promising ideas include:

- The City could offer discounted memberships for SNAP recipients, high school students, and others who would benefit most from reduced cost.
- The City could develop subsidy programs that provide free Citi Bike memberships for people participating in publicly-funded workforce development and training programs.
- State and federal agencies could include bike share memberships as an eligible pre-tax transit benefit offered by public and private sector employers.
- Private insurance companies could cover the cost of bike share memberships just as they do gym memberships. Oxford Health has recently begun to offer this benefit.

STRENGTHEN THE PARTNERSHIP

Finally, the Partnership is only as good as the ties that bind it together. Mindful of this, the partners look to **formalize their organizational structure**, **better define partner roles and responsibil-ities**, and clarify how tasks will be assigned as the work continues and the Partnership expands. In particular, as the Partnership's area of focus grows beyond Bedford Stuyvesant, and as other neighborhoods seek to replicate the collective impact model, strengthening processes for decision-making, data sharing, and prioritization of projects is essential. A clear structure will also open doors and bring confidence to creative, public-private arrangements between current and new partners.

APPENDIX

RESTORATION PARTNERSHIP STRUCTURE



IN THE NEWS

-

N.Y. / Region

The New Hork Eimes

Mayor de Blasio Announces That Citi Bike Rides Surged 40 Percent in 2016 -- Nearly 14 Million Trips Taken

December 29, 2016

New York City's bike share system shatters annual ridership record for third consecutive year, exceeding 2015 record by 4 million trips



Q

SUBSCRIBE LOG IN

#FreshMovesBKNY CAMPAIGN

In the Summer of 2015, Restoration launched a Citi Bike themed series of ads as part of their ongoing #FreshMovesBKNY healthy living campaign. The ads featured local residents and were placed in Bedford Stuyvesant subway stations and bus shelters, on local buses, and in targeted newspapers such as *Amsterdam News, Brooklyn Courier, CaribNews, Caribbean Life,* and *Our Times Press.*



ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

THE RESTORATION PARTNERSHIP THANKS ITS WONDERFUL COMMUNITY OF VOLUNTEERS AND CHAMPIONS:

David Allen, CORE Services Karen Ash Craig Baerwald, NYC DOT Joshua Board, Office of Assemblyman Walter Mosely Sybil Boone Shaquana Boykin, MARP Kizzie Brown, Jobs Plus Kweli Cambell Keith Carr, City Harvest Michelle Cornegy **City Councilmember Robert Cornegy** Anthony Divittis, Woodhull Medical Center Gigi Davis-Elliot, Office of Assemblyman Walter Mosely Sophie Delacour, BQLT Jelani De Leon Assistant Commissioner Torian Esterling, DOHMH Tanya Elder **Morris Frasier** Ben Gonzalez, Interfaith Medical Center Josiah Hobson

Gordon Jackson, CORE Services **Kisha Jackson** Tanya Jenkins, Bedford Stuyvesant YMCA Cheryl Jones, Woodhull Medical Center Robert Jones, DOHMH/Phi Beta Sigma Fraternity Sherman Jones Dordy Jourdain, Bed Stuy YMCA Roshin Kurian, DOHMH Erika Lindsey Tara Mardigan Assemblymember Walter Mosley **Tiffany Joy Muchison** Shawn Onsgard, Brooklyn Community Board 3 Elena Rofel Shunya Toqashi Tom Van Grootel Kantaki Washington Courtney Williams, Black Girls Do Bike Stefani Zinerman, Office of Councilmember **Robert Cornegy**



THE RESTORATION PARTNERSHIP

Bedford Stuyvesant Restoration Tracey Capers Verna Admu John Aysu Kirac Omar Arias Nana Minder Joanna Jacob Afia Bediako		
Citi Bike/Motivate Dani Simons Anne Krassner	NYC DOHMH Maggie Veatch Phil Noyes Tanya Kaufman Robert Jones Lauren Taylor Roshin Kurian	NYC DOT Beth Heyde Lisa Morasco
Woodhull Hospital Cheryl Jones Anthony Divittis Edward Fishkin Sherry Davis	Interfaith Hospital Benjamin Gonzalez Gwendolyn Lewis Marida Attmore Alicia Fayton-Edwards	MARP Shaquana Boykin

Contributors

Kate Fillin-Yeh, NACTO Urbane Consulting Bethany Chaney Graphic design by Carly Clark This report, and the work described herein, made possible by a grant from the Better Bike Share Partnership, a collaboration to advance equity in bike share funded by The JPB Foundation. Other funding was provided by the Centers for Disease Control, the New York State Health Foundation, and the New York State Creating Healthy Schools and Communities initiative.



- 1 Data from U.S. Census Bureau, 2000 and 2010 Census Summary File 1, Table QT-P3
- 2 Urbanomics, "The Value of Rent Subsidies from Rent Stabilization by Borough & Neighborhood of New York City." May 2009. Accessed via: http://rsanyc.net/the-value-of-rent-subsidies-from-rent-stabilization-by-borough-and-neighborhood.pdf
- 3 Badger, Emily, "What's happening in the neighborhoods with the wildest gains in home values." The Washington Post, 30, April 2016. Accessed via: <u>https://www.washingtonpost.com/news/wonk/wp/2016/04/30/what-the-best-places-to-buy-a-home-in-america-have-in-common/?utm_term=.59601cc59beb</u>
- 4 New York State Department of Labor, "Turmoil on Wall Street: The Impacts of the Financial Sector Meltdown on New York's Labor Market." June 2009. Accessed via: <u>https://www.labor.ny.gov/stats/PDFs/Wall_Street.pdf</u>
- 5 NYC Mayors Office of Recovery & Resiliency. Accessed via: http://www.nyc.gov/html/planyc/html/home/home.shtml
- 6 City of New York, "PlaNYC: A Greener, Greater New York." 2007. Accessed via: <u>http://www.nyc.gov/html/planyc/downloads/pdf/publica-tions/full_report_2007.pdf</u>
- 7 US EPA, "Source of Greenhouse Gas Emissions." Accessed via: https://www.epa.gov/ghgemissions/sources-greenhouse-gas-emissions
- 8 Data from U.S. Census Bureau, 2000 and 2010 Census Summary File 1, Table QT-P3
- 9 As part of the national Better Bike Share Partnership, PeopleForBikes, a non-profit organization that promotes bicycle friendly communities, administered \$900,000 in grants to recipients across the country to improve bike share equity, utilizing funding from the JPB Foundation.
- 10 DOHMH, "Community Health Profiles 2015: Brooklyn District 3 Bedford Stuyvesant," 2015; 27 (59): 1-15. Accessed via: <u>https://www1.</u> nyc.gov/assets/doh/downloads/pdf/data/2015chp-bk3.pdf
- 11 The Brooklyn Cooperative Federal Credit Union, along with the Lower East Side People's Federal Credit Union and the NYU Federal Credit Union, participates in Citi Bike's discounted membership program. Members of these three community development credit unions qualify for a \$5/month annual Citi Bike membership.
- 12 "Streetfilms Shortie: Black Girls Do Bike: New York City," Clarence Eckerson Jr., Streetfilms 2016. Accessed via: https://vimeo. com/176894860
- 13 Tracey Capers, Bedford Stuyvesant Restoration
- 14 While DOHMH and DOT had tried "bike to school" events in the past, the efforts rarely created lasting impacts. DOHMH, in particular, was uncertain what age group was best to target, given the incomplete nature of New York's bike lane network and other concerns about theft and rider safety.
- 15 As of January 2017, there were 5,381 active Citi Bike members living in Bedford Stuyvesant.
- 16 Fillin-Yeh, Kate, "How We'll know When We're Getting Bike Equity Right." Next City, 4/26/16. Accessed via: <u>https://nextcity.org/daily/entry/bike-share-equity-metrics-diverse-riders</u>

